

Recalibration of Political Participation to Restore Democracy and Meritocracy in the 2024 Election

Dwi Putra Nugraha

dwi.nugraha@uph.edu

¹Faculty of Law, Pelita Harapan University, Karawaci

Article Info

Received: 22 -9 - 2023

Revised: 23 - 12 - 2023

Accepted: final ready to
publish for 2023 regular
editions

Keywords:

Recalibration, political
participation

Abstract

The ideas of meritocracy and democracy are seen as running in juxtaposition. Democracy bases results on votes solely without assessing the leader's capabilities. However, meritocracy also creates tyranny in a different form. This is because democracy and meritocracy carry the values of liberalism. This article refutes the conflict between the two concepts and shows the shortcomings of both. Adjustments and improvements to the electoral system and related systems cannot be carried out on a large scale without massive political power. Recalibration of political participation is at least an initial improvement in accordance with the constitutional design of dignified balance to achieve short-term goals. Community political participation in the 2024 elections must be interpreted broadly and substantively. The Voter Participation Index initiated by the KPU has good initial ideas and objectives. However, this paper shows that the method for preparing the IPP needs to be expanded by not only basing the data on applications owned by the KPU alone.

1. Introduction

Nowadays Moments before the registration stage for President and Vice President candidates in the 2024 general election (hereinafter referred to as the 2024 Election), acrobatic politics is more prominent in the public sphere than the clash of ideas between the presidential and vice presidential candidates. The results of opinion polls on the popularity and electability of figures, combined with the possibility of controlling access to state resources and power if they win the election, are the basis of political logic in this struggle for political acrobatics without ideas.¹Dramaturgy of the Democratic Party's withdrawal from the change coalition with the Nasdem Party and the Prosperous Justice Party (PKS)

¹Vedi R. Hadiz, "Season for Political Acrobatics" Kompas, 5 September 2023.

after the entry of the National Awakening Party (PKB),²Likewise with the crowded discourse of Gibran Rakabuming Raka, mayor of Solo, who was put forward as a candidate for vice president with the granting of the request for a judicial review of case number 90/PUU-XXI/2023 by the Constitutional Court,³three days before the registration of presidential candidates and vice presidential candidates, coloring the series of election stages before the nomination of presidential candidates and vice presidential candidates. This shows political acrobatics or maneuvers that present drama and political gimmicks⁴or political machinations⁵is prioritized by politicians rather than political ideas that will be sown by voters.

These non-ideal political problems are rooted in the political logic of electoral contestation. In electoral contestation, the ideal battle talks about ideas or notions. However, because Indonesian voting behavior is more sociological in

²Willy Medi C. Nababan, et al., "Coalition Obstacles Ahead of the 2024 Presidential Election." Kompas Saturday, 2 September 2023, p. 2.; Adhyasta Dirgantara & Irfan Maulana, "7 Points of SBY's Disappointment over Anies' Betrayal." <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2023/09/02/10085441/7-poin-kekecewaan-sby-atas-pengkhianatan-anies>, accessed on October 10, 2023.

³To download Constitutional Court decision no. 90/PUU-XXI/2023 https://www.mkri.id/public/content/persidangan/besar/bangunan_mkri_9332_1697427438.pdf This MK decision provides The new meaning of one of the requirements to become President or Vice President is the age limit. In Article 169 letter q of Law Number 7 of 2017 concerning General Elections, it is stated that the requirement to become President or Vice President is to be 40 years old. The Constitutional Court considers the norm of this provision to be unconstitutional if it is not interpreted as "being at least 40 (forty) years old or having/currently held a position elected through general elections, including regional head elections." This decision was controversial because there were four judges who expressed dissenting opinions and two judges who expressed concurring opinions. One of the three other judges was deemed to have a conflict of interest because he was related to Gibran Rakabuming Raka, who benefited from the Constitutional Court's decision.

⁴For more, see Sianne Ngai, *Theory of the Gimmick: Aesthetic Judgment and Capitalist Form* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2020).

⁵Nurjiyanto, "Observer: Political Gimmicks are Ineffective in Gaining Votes" <https://www.medcom.id/pemilu/news-pemilu/yKXQwaaN-pengamat-gimmick-politik-tak-efeksi-meraup-keraspengamat-gimmick-politik-tak-effetif-meraup-warna>, accessed on October 10, 2023.

nature,⁶ then the popularity-acceptability-electability factor⁷ takes priority over capacity and capability.⁸ At this point it can be said that democracy, specifically elections, is contrary to the idea of meritocracy. Rational voters expect the battle between potential leaders to end with the election of *primus inter pares* (first among equals).⁹ Even further than that, the elected leader is like a demigod who has passed the stages of merit and is filled with natural qualities.¹⁰

However, the true final result of each competition will create a loser and a winner. It is not uncommon for victory to be glorified as the result of work that is deserved by the winner because he is worthy and deserves to be rewarded with victory. On the other hand, defeat breeds humiliation and even revenge.¹¹ This was then reviewed in depth by Michael Sandel, political philosopher at Harvard Law University, in a book entitled *The Tyranny of Merit: What Becomes of the Common Good?* He strongly criticized the idea and implementation of what we know as meritocracy. He stated:

⁶Voter behavior in electoral politics can be categorized into three. First, a sociological model that views voter behavior as determined by voters' social categories such as social class, religion, ethnic/racial/regional affiliation or language. Second, a rational model that looks at voter behavior based on political economy calculations. The emphasis is on government performance, especially related to economic conditions. Third, a psychological model that sees voters associating themselves with party identity. Saiful Mujani, R. William Liddle, and Kuskridho Ambardi, *People's Power: Analysis of Voting Behavior in Post-New Order Indonesian Legislative and Presidential Elections* (Jakarta: Mizan, 2011), p. 6., in Dwi Putra Nugraha, *Pancasila in the Vortex of Identity Politics* (Depok, Rajawali Press, 2023), p. 321.

⁷"Electability Makes Political Parties Forget Ideology", <https://ugm.ac.id/en/news/13327-electability-makes-political-parties-forget-ideology/>, accessed on October 13, 2023.

⁸Djohermansyah Djohan who was cited by the Petitioner in Constitutional Court Decision No. 15/PUU-XX/2022, p. 29. Look https://www.mkri.id/public/content/persidangan/ruling/ruling_mkri_8458_1650431153.pdf; see also Daniel Bell, 2015, *The China Model: Political Meritocracy and the Limits of Democracy*, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

⁹First of equals as a translation of *primus inter pares* is often attached to the thoughts of Thomas Hobbes. In his book *Leviathan*, Thomas Hobbes states "This is more than consent, or concord; it is a real unity of them all, in one and the same person, made by covenant of every man with every man, in such manner, as if every man should say to every man, I authorize and give up my right of governing myself, to this man, or to this assembly of men, on this condition, that thou give up thy right to him, and authorize all his actions in like manner. This done, the multitude so united in one person, is called a COMMONWEALTH, in Latin CIVITAS. This is the generation of that great LEVIATHAN, or rather (to speak more reverently) of that Mortal God, to whom we owe under the Immortal God, our peace and defense." Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), p. 114.

¹⁰Muhammad Subarkah, "The Story of Ratu Adil: From Prince, Haji, to Kiai" <https://algebra.republika.co.id/posts/189723/cerita-ratu-adil-dari-pangeran-haji-hingga-kiai>

¹¹Although of course in politics the winner can later embrace the loser in order to achieve momentary political interests.

“Those who celebrate the meritocratic ideal and make it the center of their political project overlook this moral question. They also ignore something more politically potent: the morally unattractive attitudes the meritocratic ethic promotes, among the winners and also among the losers. Among the winners, it generates hubris; among the losers, humiliation and resentment. These moral sentiments are at the heart of the populist uprising against elites. More than a protest against immigrants and outsourcing, the populist complaint is about the tyranny of merit. And the complaint is justified.”¹²

In other words, meritocracy breeds arrogance. This is because there is a tendency for those at the top of the pyramid, the winners, to believe that their success is the result of their abilities. Therefore, the implication is that those who struggle in the middle or bottom of the pyramid, the defeated, must accept their fate too.

This article conveys the argument that the idea of unifying the concept of meritocracy or the best talent in the political field is no better than the manifestation of democracy in electoral contestation which produces leaders who prioritize electability over capability. As mentioned above, the idea of meritocracy actually creates its own tyranny. This is because the liberalism behind it led to the birth right lottery¹³ and places humans into unencumbered selves.¹⁴ Humans exist atomistically and are not constrained by various group values that translate their identity. Thoughts that are trapped in the original position idea are in the shadows and continue to live in the veil of ignorance.

In the debate between liberalism and communitarianism, republicanism tries to be the middle point. Meanwhile, in the idea of republicanism, participation is the main value. So at least people's political participation in democracy, especially in elections, is a short-term correction mechanism for the shortcomings of democracy and meritocracy mentioned previously. Political

¹²Michael J. Sandel, 2021, *The Tyranny of Merit: What's Become of the Common Good?* New York: Penguin, p. 28.

¹³“For those granted a head start simply because they were born into a thriving political community, it may be difficult to appreciate the extent to which others are disadvantaged due to the lottery of birthright. But the global statistics are revealing. Children born in the poorest nations are five times more likely to die before the age of five. Those who survive their early years will, in all likelihood, lack access to basic subsistence services such as clean water and shelter, and are ten times more likely to be mal-nourished than children in wealthier countries. Many will not enjoy access to even basic education, and those out of school are more likely to be girls than boys.” Ayelet Schachar, *The Birthright Lottery: Citizenship and Global Inequality* (London: Harvard University Press, 2009), p. 3.

¹⁴“a self understood as prior to and independent of purposes and ends.” Michael J. Sandel, “The Procedural Republic and the Unencumbered Self”, *Political Theory*, Vol. 12, no. 1, Feb. 1984., p. 86.

participation is a political right referring to an individual's ability to participate in the political-civil life of society and the state without repression and discrimination.¹⁵ This shows that citizen political participation is vital in the application of human rights in the form of political rights. By submitting itself to the will of the people which is reflected in the channels of political participation, modern democracy finds one of its main foundations, namely accountable government.¹⁶ This means that government accountability can be fulfilled if the space for political participation is opened as widely as possible.

However, up to now, public participation in politics, especially elections, has been reduced to the mere presence of voters in the voting booth to vote. In fact, political participation includes, but is not limited to, involvement in the preparation of policies and regulations, a series of policy making processes, recruitment or selection for political or government positions, control and evaluation of policies, and so on. Therefore, in order to recalibrate the meaning of public participation in elections, the General Election Commission (hereinafter referred to as the KPU) has prepared an Election Participation Index (hereinafter referred to as IPP). Apart from criticizing the weakness of democratic ideas in elections and the tyranny of meritocracy, this article will also describe and criticize IPP.

2. Research Method

The approach The research method used in this paper is the normative juridical method. The data used is secondary data using available data that already exists in the literature. Data analysis using a qualitative approach, especially with the concepts of democracy, meritocracy and political participation.

3. Results and Discussion

¹⁵Commission On Security And Cooperation In Europe, "Citizenship and Political Rights," <https://www.csce.gov/issue/citizenship-and-political-rights#:~:text=Political%20rights%20refer%20to%20an,tied%20closely%20to%20citizenship%20status,> accessed on 24 August 2023.

¹⁶For Fukuyama, government accountability is an important element of the institutions that guide the realization of a modern democratic state. Francis Fukuyama, *The Origins of Political Order: From Prehuman Times to the French Revolution* (New York: Farrar, Straus, Giroux, 2011), p. 15.

In 2017 Yascha Mounk and Roberto Stefan Foa said that democracy was experiencing deconsolidation. Society is increasingly dissatisfied with state institutions and basic norms that have been fundamental to democracy.¹⁷ The era we live in now illustrates the decline of democracy in various parts of the world which has been echoed by various scholars. Apart from the phrase "democracy deconsolidation" there are also other phrases used to indicate the decline of democracy from "democracy in retreat,"¹⁸ "democratic recession,"¹⁹ "democratic backsliding,"²⁰ "constitutional retrogression,"²¹ "constitutional failure,"²² to "constitutional rot."²³

The first step that must be taken in explaining the existing problems is to provide the meaning of democracy which was previously mentioned as experiencing setbacks. For Ginsburg and Huq, various philosophers and scholars debated intensely what the essence of democracy was and the results were not found in agreement. However, at least there is a generalization that the idea of democracy is closely associated with general elections.²⁴ Joseph Schumpeter stated democracy as "an institutional arrangement for arriving at political decisions in which individuals acquire the power to decide by means of a competitive struggle for the people's vote."²⁵ Not much different, Adam Przeworski stated that democracy is "a system in which parties lose elections,"²⁶ (and in his other writings) "a regime in which those who govern are

¹⁷"Citizens of democracies are less and less content with their institutions; they are more and more willing to jettison institutions and norms that have traditionally been regarded as central components of democracy; and they are increasingly attracted to alternative regime forms." Roberto Stefan Foa & Yascha Mounk, "The Democratic Disconnect", *Journal of Democracy*, Volume 27, Number 3, July 2016, Pg. 16

¹⁸Joshua Kurlantzick, *Democracy in Retreat: The Revolt of the Middle Class and the Worldwide Decline of Representative Government* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014).

¹⁹Larry Diamond, "Facing Up to the Democratic Recession," *Journal of Democracy* 26 (2015): 141.

²⁰Nancy Bermeo, "On Democratic Backsliding," *Journal of Democracy* 28 (2017):5.

²¹Aziz Z. Huq and Tom Ginsburg, "How to Lose a Constitutional Democracy," *UCLA Law Review* 65 (2018): 78, 83.

²²Sotirios A. Barber, *Constitutional Failure* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2014). See also Ellen Kennedy, *Constitutional Failure: Carl Schmitt on Weimar* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004).

²³Jack M. Balkin, "Constitutional Crisis and Constitutional Rot," in ed. Mark A. Graber, Sanford Levinson, and Mark Tushnet, *Constitutional Democracy in Crisis?*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2018).

²⁴Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Z. Huq, "Defining and Tracking the Trajectory of Liberal Constitutional Democracy", in *Ibid.*, p. 33.

²⁵Joseph Schumpeter, *Capitalism, Socialism, Democracy* (New York: Harper & Row), p. 269, in *Ibid.*, p. 33.

²⁶Adam Przeworski, *Democracy and the Market: Political and Economic Reforms in Eastern Europe and Latin America* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1991), p. 10., *Ibid.*, p. 33.

selected through contested elections."²⁷ However, this minimalist idea of democracy finds its own complexity. China, which also holds elections, certainly cannot be categorized as a democratic country. Due to the complexity of defining democracy, Ginsburg and Huq coined the phrase "liberal constitutional democracy" which injects a normative element into the delineation of democracy. They integrate three components that are interrelated and must be present to declare a country called "liberal constitutional democracy", namely: democratic electoral system; particular liberal rights to speech and association; and rule of law.²⁸ In another writing, Ginsburg again emphasized the role of the judiciary, especially the Constitutional Court, which has the authority to review constitutional matters to ensure democracy is not eroded.²⁹

If we use a minimalist understanding of democracy and equate democracy with elections, then the question arises whether elections are currently experiencing a setback like democracy? Holly Ann Garnett and Toby S. James' views answer this question with a middle ground. For them, of the many factors that can have an impact on the quality of elections, there are three possible phenomena or answers that can emerge, namely: electoral backsliding, electoral strengthening, and electoral divergence.³⁰ First, with the erosion of democracy, elections also experience a similar phenomenon. Currently, authoritarian governments are more innovative in creating authoritarian governments with mechanisms that appear democratic through elections.³¹ Second, the current structural conditions actually create better election quality. The development of the digital world allows government accountability to be at its highest point, for example cases such as the "Panama Papers", "Cambridge Analytica", "Team Jorge".³² The third thesis, which is proposed by Garnett and James, assesses that there is electoral divergence. There was no wholesale setback, but there was a strengthening of elections in certain parts of the world but there was a setback to elections in other parts of the world. For them this happens because certain stages of the electoral cycle react differently in each country. It is possible that the campaign stages in a country are impacted by digital developments. Meanwhile,

²⁷Adam Przeworski, Michal E. Alvarez, Jose Antonio Cheibub, and Fernando Limongi, *Democracy and Development; Political Institutions and Well-Being in the World, 1950-1990* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000), p. 15., in *Ibid.*, p. 33.

²⁸*Ibid.*, p. 36.

²⁹Tom Ginsburg, "Democratic Backsliding and the Rule of Law," *Ohio Northern University Law Review*, Vol. 44, 2018, p. 352.

³⁰Holly Ann Garnett and Toby S. James, "Electoral backsliding? Democratic divergence and trajectories in the quality of elections worldwide", *Electoral Studies*, Vol. 86, December 2023.

³¹See the various innovations launched by authoritarian governments in Lee Morgenbesser's article, "The menu of autocratic innovation", *Democratization*, Vol. 27. 2020, p. 1053-1072.

³²Garnett & James, "Electoral Backsliding?..." p. 2.

the permanent voter list in other countries was more affected than the campaign stage.³³ Thus, it can be said that the decline in democracy in all parts of the world does not necessarily result in a decline in elections.

Of the various stages in the election cycle, the presidential and vice presidential nomination stage is one of the crucial stages that shows the maturity of democracy. As explained in the background, democracy can become an arena for demagogues to come to power. As was Socrates' concern that democracy could give birth to tyranny because people were not yet educated, knowledgeable and thought critically. The ship of the state metaphor in Socrates and Adeimantus's conversation precisely reveals the weakness of democracy.³⁴ Democracy in its minimalist form in the form of elections can create incomplete or asymmetric information so that voters are dazzled by electability which is supported by the shrewdness of demagogues in electoral politics. Democracy with all its setbacks leads voters with the power of emotion (anger, fear, and all other forms of unpleasant emotions) to support certain candidates instead of being based on logical and critical thinking.

This weakness in democracy is corrected with the idea that voters must be able to choose the most qualified, most competent or capable candidate. The idea of meritocracy then emerged in voters' minds. Michael Young, who coined the term meritocracy, wondered what if the boundaries between classes were broken down so that everyone really had the same opportunity to develop according to their abilities.³⁵ For him, meritocracy is not an ideal goal but is a recipe for social disharmony. Sandel believes that there are at least two reasons why meritocracy can still be used as a reason for decision making, namely efficiency and fairness. Productivity arises from competition for talent and rewarding someone based on merit creates fairness, because it eliminates discrimination due to factors other than achievement.³⁶ However, there is a dark side to meritocracy, namely the aspect of triumphalism, which fosters the idea of glorifying winners and denigrating losers. There was a social gap that destroyed the social fabric that had been painstakingly woven in the ideas of nationality and unity. Elections that emphasize meritocracy will create social rifts that divide diametrically.

³³Ibid., p. 3.

³⁴Voters are like ship owners who are short-sighted and deaf and cannot clearly differentiate who can be the captain of the ship. So the captain of the ship fell on the choice of someone who was skilled at persuading the ship owner. Plato, *The Republic*, Ed. GRF Ferrari (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 488a-489a, pp. 191.

³⁵Michael Young, *The Rise of the Meritocracy* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1958).

³⁶Sandel, *Tyranny of Merit*, p. 36.

If the dark face of democracy allows demagogue politicians to manipulate the will of voters in order to fulfill their desire for power, meritocracy gives birth to its tyranny, namely a feeling of triumphalism for the winner. Therefore, so that democracy and meritocracy do not show their negative side specifically in electoral contestation, the holder of sovereignty, namely the people (voters in elections) must take their role. It is the sovereignty of the people that underlies and drives the implementation and results of elections. Public participation in elections must be recalibrated, not only measured by voter turnout but broad and meaningful participation at every stage of the election cycle. For example, the involvement of social identity groups (religious leaders, traditional leaders, etc.) in the formation of legislative regulations in the field of elections. The researcher directly saw voter participation in the form of socialization and political education involving the church in collaboration with the Ohoi government (as the village on the Kei Islands is called) and the Saniri Agency (as the Village Consultative Body).³⁷

Apart from that, so that elections are not seen as an arena for clashes of ideas or mere social strife, the KPU has announced that elections can also be a means of national integration. Elections must be able to be a bridge between two poles separated by ideological or identity barriers. Apart from that, the design of simultaneous elections, in practical politics, encourages political parties to form coalitions to nominate leaders at the national and local levels.³⁸ The design of simultaneous elections in the same year between national elections and regional head elections also brings changes to the KPU Regulations regarding community participation which are then regulated by KPU Regulation Number 9 of 2022 concerning Community Participation in General Elections and the Election of Governors and Deputy Governors, Regent and Deputy Regent, and/or Mayor and Deputy Mayor. In order to measure the level of community participation, the KPU uses the Community Participation Information System (SIPARMAS). Apart from that, the KPU also compiled a Voter Participation Index (hereinafter referred to as IPP).

IPP is interpreted as a tool that makes it possible to measure how the community and their role play in the election process. An index is a tool that shows levels or amounts with a scale or weighting. Here, what is measured is how the community participates in the election preparation, implementation and

³⁷The research was conducted in Ohoi Ohoira, Kei Kecil Barat District, Southeast Maluku Regency, Maluku Province on 15-20 September 2023.

³⁸diR, "Commitment to Make Elections a Means of National Integration," <https://www.kpu.go.id/berita/baca/10581/komitmen-jadikan-pemilu-sarana-integra-si-bangsa>, accessed on October 10, 2023.

evaluation process. The greater the role and participation of the community in activities related to the process, the more involvement can be measured through the Election Participation Index.³⁹ To provide a more accurate picture of public participation in elections, an IPP must be created. In it, various dimensions of participation are reviewed, starting from the election preparation process, election administration, to post-election evaluation. The variables for each dimension indicate the strategic stages of holding elections. IPP helps develop an election data base that is useful for stakeholders, apart from being intended to provide a more comprehensive measuring tool for election participation.⁴⁰ In general IPP is usually measured in percentage terms and can be used to compare voter turnout between different elections and regions. The higher this index, the higher the voter turnout, which is often considered a sign of strong democracy and active involvement of citizens in the political process.

In dissemination by the KPU, the IPP was prepared using three dimensions, nine variables and 15 indicators. The three dimensions of the IPP are adjusted to the election cycle stages, namely the election preparation process, the election implementation process, and the post-election process. Meanwhile, the details of the nine IPP variables are as follows:⁴¹

1. Dimensions of participation in the election preparation process:
 - Participation in the process of establishing election management institutions;
 - Participation in the election participant registration process; And
 - Participation in the process of compiling the voter list.
2. Dimensions of participation in the election implementation process:
 - Participation in the voter education process;
 - Participation in the nomination process;
 - Participation in the campaign process;
 - Participation in the voting process; And
 - Participation in the vote counting and recapitulation process.
3. Dimensions of participation in the post-election process:
 - Participation in the election evaluation process.

The indicators compiled in the IPP are as follows:

1. Participation in the recruitment of ad hoc election organizers;⁴²

³⁹ Aditya Perdana, et al., *Election Participation Index: for the 2024 Election*, (Jakarta: General Election Commission of the Republic of Indonesia, 2023), p. 17.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, p. 28.

⁴² See how many people register to take part in the recruitment process at the Ad-hoc level (PPK and PPS) based on their own desires and interest in political issues. This is very important

2. Participation in the verification stages of political parties and DPD nominations;⁴³
3. Participation in the preparation of voter lists;⁴⁴
4. Participation in various voter education programs organized by the KPU;⁴⁵
5. Participation in various voter education programs organized by other parties;⁴⁶
6. Participation in executive election nominations;⁴⁷
7. Participation in legislative election nominations;⁴⁸

because of participation in the recruitment of organizers *ad-hoc* has a direct aspect of control over the quality of election implementation. *Ibid.*, p. 44. The operationalization used is: Average number of PPK and PPS registrants; Average number of public responses to PPK and PPS selection. The weight for this indicator is 7.43%. *Ibid.*, p. 49.

⁴³ Seeing how many people take the initiative in checking their identity in registering for political parties based on their own desires and interest in political issues. This is very important because participation in political party registration has aspects on the quality of electoral contestation. *Ibid.*, p. 45. The operationalization used is: Number of NIK checks in election information; Number of reporters of name profiteering by political parties; Number of reporters of name profiteering by prospective DPD members. The weight for this indicator is 6.47%. *Ibid.*, p. 44.

⁴⁴ Seeing how many people take their own initiative in checking their identity in voter registration based on their own desires and interest in political issues. This is very important because participation in voter registration has aspects in the exercise of voting rights. *Ibid.*, p. 45. The operationalization used is: Number of DPT checks (cekdptonline.kpu); Number of reports from the public because they have not registered as voters; Number of requests to move voting. The weight for this indicator is 6.95%. *Ibid.*, p. 50.

⁴⁵ Every individual attends and takes part in voter education activities/activities organized by the KPU. This is very important because electoral literacy will affect the quality of participation. *Ibid.*, p. 45. The operationalization used is: Number of people involved in KPU voter education activities; Socioeconomic characteristics. The weight for this indicator is 6.95%. *Ibid.*, p. 50.

⁴⁶ Each individual attends and takes part in voter education activities/activities organized by Bawaslu and the Ministry of Home Affairs/Kesbangpol. This is very important because electoral literacy will affect the quality of participation. *Ibid.* p. 45. The operationalization used is: Number of people involved in Bawaslu's participatory supervision activities; Number of people involved in Kesbangpol political education activities. The weight for this indicator is 6.95%. *Ibid.*, p. 50.

⁴⁷ Each individual or group participates by accessing and discussing matters and information related to the vision and mission of the presidential/vice presidential candidate. This is very important because electoral literacy will affect the quality of participation and contestation. *Ibid.*, p. 45. The operationalization used is: The number of people who access the KPU website to see the vision and mission of the presidential and vice presidential candidates. The weight for this indicator is 6.62%. *Ibid.*, p. 50.

⁴⁸ Each individual or group participates by accessing and discussing matters and information related to the vision and mission of DPR, DPD and DPRD legislative candidates. This is important because electoral literacy will influence the quality of participation and contestation. *Ibid.*, p. 46. The operationalization used is: The number of people who access the KPU website to view the profiles of candidates for DPR RI, DPD, Provincial and District/City DPRD. The weight for this indicator is 6.69%. *Ibid.*, p. 51.

8. Participation (body/individual) in campaign funding (political parties);⁴⁹
9. Participation in offline campaigns;⁵⁰
10. Participation in online campaigns;⁵¹
11. Participation in social media;⁵²
12. Participation in voting;⁵³
13. Participation in the vote counting and recapitulation stages;⁵⁴
14. Participation in executive election evaluation;⁵⁵
15. Participation in the evaluation of legislative elections.⁵⁶

⁴⁹Every individual or group participates by accessing SIDAKAM and donating campaign funds. This is important because it affects the quality of the contest.*Ibid.*, p. 46. The operationalization used is: Number of people accessing SIDAKAM; Number of people who contributed to executive election campaign funds; Number of people who contributed to campaign funds for DPR, DPD, Provincial and District/City DPRD elections. The weight for this indicator is 5.73%. *Ibid.*, p. 51.

⁵⁰Each individual or group participates in campaign activities which are held offline with restrictions on activities carried out by election participants and reported to the KPU. This is important because electoral literacy will influence the quality of participation and contestation.*Ibid.*, p. 46. The operationalization used is: The number of people who participated in the offline campaign carried out by election participants. The weight for this indicator is 6.58%. *Ibid.*, p. 51.

⁵¹Every individual or group participates in campaign activities held online with restrictions on activities carried out by election participants and reported to the KPU. This is important because electoral literacy will influence the quality of participation and contestation.*Ibid.*, p. 46. The operationalization used is: The number of people who participate in online campaigns carried out by election participants. The weight for this indicator is 6.07%. *Ibid.*, p. 51.

⁵²Public participation on social media accounts of election participants registered with the KPU. This is important because electoral literacy will influence the quality of participation and contestation.*Ibid.*, p. 46. The operationalization used is: Number of social media followers of election participants registered with the KPU. The weight for this indicator is 6.62%. *Ibid.*, p. 51.

⁵³Community participation in exercising their right to vote during elections. This is very important because voting is part of the exercise of political rights.*Ibid.*, p. 46. The operationalization used is: Voting rights user data; Invalid ballot data. The weight for this indicator is 7.84%. *Ibid.*, p. 52.

⁵⁴Individual and group participation in observing and supervising the counting and recapitulation of election votes. This is important because participating in the counting and recapitulation of votes affects the quality of contestation and accountability of election results.*Ibid.*, p. 46. The operationalization used is: Number of election observers (accredited); Number of survey institutions conducting opinion polls; Number of people who submitted reports to Bawaslu. The weight for this indicator is 6.73%. *Ibid.*, p. 52.

⁵⁵Activities carried out consciously for oneself or a group in order to show interest in executive election issues. This is important because participating in executive election evaluations affects the quality of contestation and accountability of election results.*Ibid.*, p. 47. The operationalization used is: The number of parties involved in the KPU's evaluation of the implementation of executive elections. The weight for this indicator is 6.03%. *Ibid.*, p. 52.

⁵⁶Activities carried out consciously for oneself or a group in order to show interest in legislative election issues. This is important because participating in legislative elections affects the quality of contestation and accountability of election results.*Ibid.*, p., 47. The operationalization used is:

After determining the dimensions, variables and indicators (including operational technical definitions) in the IPP, the method used in collecting data uses existing data in various KPU systems or databases, including the KPU Member Information System and Ad Hoc Bodies (SIKBA), Political Party Information System (SIPOL), DPR Nomination Information System, Provincial DPRD, Regency/City DPRD (SILON), Community Participation Information System (SIPARMAS), Campaign Fund Information System (SIDAKAM), Voter Data Information System (SIDALIH), and etc.

The method of collecting IPP data needs to be criticized together. The database owned by the KPU and its various applications often overlap. In general, the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology has complained about the number of applications in the ministry, which number up to 24 thousand.⁵⁷ This means that if a similar complaint can be addressed to the KPU, a superApp needs to be formed. In addition, IPP data collection should not only use data in applications. The data collected, both quantitative and qualitative, can complement the existing data in the application. Therefore, data collection tools are needed that are more than just KPU applications. What has been initiated by the KPU is very good in trying to recalibrate the understanding of voter participation in the 2024 elections. However, the procedures for achieving the originally planned goals because they are not optimal can end up being counter-productive. Thus, it can be said that the voter participation index does not fully describe real community participation.

4. Conclusion

The Demagogues and political entrepreneurs who prioritize electability without capability in the realm of democracy and self-pride triumphalism which creates social rifts in the midst of unity as an excess of the idea of meritocracy, can be treated in the short term through community participation. Wide and meaningful voter participation by involving voters in fulfilling their rights (being heard, considered and given answers/explanations) in elections must be carried out. Recalibrating the meaning and implementation of voter participation by the KPU is therefore a good effort. However, the preparation of the IPP to map voter participation with indicators and operationalization based on the KPU's built-in

The number of parties involved in the KPU's evaluation of the implementation of legislative elections. The weight for this indicator is 6.32%. Ibid., p. 52.

⁵⁷can/arh, "Kominfo Complains about 24 Thousand Applications in the Ministry, Prepares 1 Super App," <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/technology/20220711123956-185-819936/kominfo-keluhkan-24-ribu-aplikasi-di-kementerian-cepatkan-1-super-app>, accessed on October 10, 2023.

database must be criticized. The KPU database and its information system are limited in actually mapping voter participation. Indexes that are then compiled to measure voter participation can lead to inaccurate results. Therefore, it is necessary for the KPU to use data collection beyond the data available in the KPU database alone.

5. Acknowledgement

The author would like to thank LPPM UPH, Faculty of LawUPH, Indonesia, and all parties who have assisted during this paper's writing.

References

Decision

Constitutional Court Decision No. 90/PUU-XXI/2023

Book

Adam Przeworski, *Democracy and the Market: Political and Economic Reforms in Eastern Europe and Lation America* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1991).

Adam Przeworski, Michal E. Alvarez, Jose Antonio Cheibub, and Fernando Limongi, *Democracy and Development; Political Institutions and Well-Being in the World, 1950-1990* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000).

Aditya Perdana, et al., *Election Participation Index: for the 2024 Election*, (Jakarta: General Election Commission of the Republic of Indonesia, 2023).

Ayelet Schachar, *The Birthright Lottery: Citizenship and Global Inequality* (London: Harvard University Press, 2009)

Dwi Putra Nugraha, *Pancasila in the Vortex of Identity Politics* (Depok, Rajawali Press, 2023).

Daniel Bell, 2015, *The China Model: Political Meritocracy and the Limits of Democracy*, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Ellen Kennedy, *Constitutional Failure: Carl Schmitt on Weimar* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004).

Sianne Ngai, *Theory of the Gimmick: Aesthetic Judgment and Capitalist Form* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2020).

Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998).

Michael J. Sandel, 2021, *The Tyranny of Merit: What's Become of the Common Good?* New York: Penguin.

Francis Fukuyama, *The Origins of Political Order: From Prehuman Times to the French Revolution* (New York: Farrar, Straus, Giroux, 2011).

Joshua Kurlantzick, *Democracy in Retreat: The Revolt of the Middle Class and the Worldwide Decline of Representative Government* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014).

- Sotirios A. Barber, *Constitutional Failure* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2014).
- Mark A. Graber, Sanford Levinson, and Mark Tushnet, *Constitutional Democracy in Crisis?*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2018).
- Joseph Schumpeter, *Capitalism, Socialism, Democracy* (New York: Harper & Row).
- Plato, *The Republic*, Ed. GRF Ferrari (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 488a-489a, pp. 191.
- Michael Young, *The Rise of the Meritocracy* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1958).

Journal

- Michael J. Sandel, "The Procedural Republic and the Unencumbered Self", *Political Theory*, Vol. 12, no. 1, Feb. 1984.
- Larry Diamond, "Facing Up to the Democratic Recession," *Journal of Democracy* 26 (2015).
- Nancy Bermeo, "On Democratic Backsliding," *Journal of Democracy* 28 (2017).
- Aziz Z. Huq and Tom Ginsburg, "How to Lose a Constitutional Democracy," *UCLA Law Review* 65 (2018).
- Roberto Stefan Foa & Yascha Mounk, "The Democratic Disconnect", *Journal of Democracy*, Volume 27, Number 3, July 2016.
- Tom Ginsburg, "Democratic Backsliding and the Rule of Law," *Ohio Northern University Law Review*, Vol. 44, 2018.
- Holly Ann Garnett and Toby S. James, "Electoral backsliding? Democratic divergence and trajectories in the quality of elections worldwide", *Electoral Studies*, Vol. 86, December 2023.
- Lee Morgenbesser, "The menu of autocratic innovation", *Democratization*, Vol. 27. 2020.

Newspaper

- Vedi R. Hadiz, "Season for Political Acrobatics" *Kompas*, 5 September 2023.
- Willy Medi C. Nababan, et al., "Coalition Obstacles Ahead of the 2024 Presidential Election." *Kompas Saturday*, 2 September 2023, p. 2.;

Internet

- diR, "Commitment to Make Elections a Means of National Integration,"<https://www.kpu.go.id/berita/baca/10581/komitmen-jadikan-pemilu-sarana-integra-si-bangsa>
- can/arh, "Kominfo Complains about 24 Thousand Applications in the Ministry, Prepares 1 Super App,"<https://www.cnnindonesia.com/technology/20220711123956-185-819936/kominfo-keluhkan-24-ribu-aplikasi-di-kementerian-cepatkan-1-super-app>, accessed on October 10, 2023.
- Adhyasta Dirgantara & Irfan Maulana, "7 Points of SBY's Disappointment over Anies' Betrayal."<https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2023/09/02/10085441/7-poin-kekecewaan-sby-atas-pengkhianatan-anies>, accessed on October 10, 2023.

Nurjiyanto, "Observer: Political Gimmicks are Ineffective in Gaining Votes"<https://www.medcom.id/pemilu/news-pemilu/yKXQwaaN-pengamat-gimmick-politik-tak-efeksi-meraup-keraspengamat-gimmick-politik-tak-effetif-meraup-warna>, accessed on October 10, 2023.

"Electability Makes Political Parties Forget Ideology",<https://ugm.ac.id/en/news/13327-electability-makes-political-parties-forget-ideology/>, accessed on October 13, 2023.

Muhammad Subarkah, "The Story of Ratu Adil: From Prince, Haji, to Kiai"<https://algebra.republika.co.id/posts/189723/cerita-ratu-adil-dari-pangeran-haji-hingga-kiai>

Commission On Security And Cooperation In Europe, "Citizenship and Political Rights,"<https://www.csce.gov/issue/citizenship-and-political-rights#:~:text=Political%20rights%20refer%20to%20an,tied%20closely%20to%20citizenship%20status.>, accessed on 24 August 2023.