

Reforming State Administration Law in the Digital Era: The Impact on Public Policy Efficiency

Firdaus Arifin

Faculty of Law, Pasundan University, Bandung, Indonesia

Article Info

Received: 2024-9-8

Revised: 2024-12-19

Accepted: 2024-12-20

Keywords : State
Administrative Law;
Public policy;
Technology;
Transparency,
Accountability.

Abstract

The evolution of state administrative law in the digital era has become imperative to accommodate the ever-changing advancements in technology. Utilising technology in public administration can improve accountability, transparency, and public participation. The objective of this study is to examine the necessity of reform in state administrative law in Indonesia in response to the problems posed by the digital era, specifically in relation to the execution of technology-driven public policy. The strategy employed is a normative legal methodology, which involves analysing literature and relevant rules. The research findings suggest that the existing legislative framework for administration does not adequately facilitate the efficient deployment of digital technologies in government. There is a pressing requirement for the establishment of regulations that are more suited to accommodate technological progress. This research highlights the significance of law reform and the establishment of digital infrastructure that enhances the efficiency of government in Indonesia. This change is anticipated to bolster accountability and transparency in the formulation of public policies, while also fostering greater community participation in the governing process.

I. Introduction

The exponential growth of information technology has propelled the globe into the digital age, where nearly every facet of human existence has experienced substantial change. This transformation has a significant impact on both the corporate and social sectors, as well as on governance and the administration of state law. The process of digitalisation necessitates a fundamental shift in the manner in which nations handle public policy, particularly with regards to transparency, effectiveness, and citizen involvement. Technologies such as big data, artificial intelligence, and blockchain offer governments new avenues to improve the efficiency of public programmes (Dharmawan et al., 2024). Nevertheless, the question that arises is whether the existing administrative law system is capable of keeping pace with these technological advancements.

Administrative law, as a mechanism that governs the interaction between the government and society, needs to adjust in order to be pertinent and efficient in addressing the complexities of contemporary governance (Disantara et al., 2023). Traditional administrative law, which has historically been used as the basis for decision-making and policy execution, needs to be updated to better address technical advancements due to the rise of digital technology. The legal incapacity to adjust to these changes might impede the efficacy of public policy, resulting in a disparity between the intended policies and their practical implementation (Dharmawan, Sarjana, et al., 2023). Hence, a comprehensive examination is required to ascertain how administrative law might adapt to guarantee the efficient implementation of governmental policy in the digital age.

Given the rapid advancement of technology, administrative law encounters substantial difficulties in harmonising rules with digital innovation (Kurniawan, 2022c). An inherent problem is in the current regulatory framework's incapacity to effectively adapt to the intricate and rapid advancements in technology. Frequently, administrative law fails to keep pace with digital advancements, resulting in a disparity between legislation and the necessary practices to facilitate effective governance. This matter is becoming more importance in the realm of public policy, since the lack of proper legal framework to facilitate the utilisation of emerging technologies like big data, artificial intelligence, and digital governance sometimes obstructs the implementation of policies.

The current regulatory constraints further worsen the disconnect between decision-making and policy implementation (Dharmawan, Kasih, et al., 2023). This occurs when the policies formulated are not properly put into practice on the ground due to the legal system's failure to address the requirements of modern technology. Moreover, in the absence of a flexible legal structure, there is a danger that public policy may fail to fulfil its purpose of promoting transparency,

participation, and public responsibility (Efendi & Disantara, 2022). This research focuses on identifying and addressing specific challenges in reforming administrative law to enhance the efficiency of public policy in the digital age. It also explores the potential implications for improving governance in the future.

The objective of this research is to investigate the changes that occur in administrative law during the digital age and how these changes impact the efficiency of public policy. This research aims to determine how administrative law can effectively respond to technological improvements, such as the digitisation of public services and the utilisation of big data technologies in policy-making. This research seeks to comprehend the difficulties encountered by administrative law in the digital age and examine the necessary measures for legal laws to become more agile and adaptable to technology changes.

Likewise, this study seeks to evaluate the impact of incorporating technology into public administration procedures on the efficacy of policies, specifically in relation to openness, public engagement, and governmental efficiency. This analysis aims to offer precise recommendations to policymakers on how to establish a more efficient legal framework that can effectively support governance in the digital era. The project aims to contribute to the development of more pertinent and groundbreaking administrative law in response to the problems posed by globalisation and digitalisation.

Although digital technology has been widely adopted in numerous government sectors, there is a lack of comprehensive literature that examines the development of administrative law in response to these changes (Ningrat & Kurniawan, 2023). Numerous studies prioritise the conventional elements of administrative law while neglecting the digital dynamics that are progressively dominating contemporary governance. The absence of empirical studies quantifying the extent to which administrative law laws can adapt to technological innovation highlights a gap in understanding the effectiveness of technology-based public policies.

In addition, in developing nations such as Indonesia, there remains a deficiency in research that especially investigates the amalgamation of digital technology with administrative law rules within the framework of decentralisation and regional autonomy. This is an extra obstacle for the government in adopting efficient public policy in the digital era. This research seeks to address the existing gap in the literature by conducting a thorough analysis of how administrative law can adapt to technological advancements. Additionally, it aims to contribute to the development of a legal framework that can effectively support public policy in the digital age.

This study provides a novel insight into the changes occurring in administrative law throughout the digital era, with a specific emphasis on how these changes impact the efficiency of public policy. An innovative aspect of this research is the thorough

examination of how digital technologies, such as big data and artificial intelligence, can be incorporated into the structure of administrative law to establish a governance system that is characterised by increased transparency, efficiency, and participation. While a significant portion of the existing literature is limited to conventional approaches in administrative law, this research emphasises the need of regulation updates in tackling the intricacies of digital governance.

This research is particularly justified in the context of legal growth in developing nations, such as Indonesia, where there is often a delay in responding to technical advancements. This research offers concrete value to policymakers by utilising empirical analysis and data-driven recommendations to assist in the formulation of adaptive policies that align with digital advancements. This research is significant not only for its theoretical features but also for the practical advantages it is predicted to provide. These advantages include improving the effectiveness of public policy, enhancing accountability, and promoting broader community participation in the governance process.

II. Research Method

This study utilises a normative legal research methodology to analyse the relevant legal norms pertaining to the integration of digital technology in government administration. The methods employed include the statutory approach, the conceptual approach, and the comparative approach. (method that involves comparing different things or situations). (method that involves comparing different things or situations) The data collection process involved conducting library research, with secondary data being the main source of information. The research included qualitative analytic approaches for data analysis. The data collected from the literature review is analysed using descriptive and evaluative methods to identify legal difficulties that arise in relation to the application of digital technology in state administration.

III. Results and Discussion

A. The Impact of Information and Communication Technology on the Transformation of Administrative Law.

In the digital era, administrative law has seen substantial changes in the regulations and policies that control the relationship between the government and society. This legal innovation involves not only the utilisation of information technology but also the modification of regulations to guarantee that the administrative process maintains

transparency and accountability. Several countries have implemented legislation to govern the utilisation of personal information in public administration, taking inspiration from regulations like the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) in the European Union (Demšar, 2024).

An essential element of this change involves incorporating transparency ideals into public management. Research undertaken by the OECD has shown that openness in government not only improves accountability but also bolsters public trust in institutions (Bezzina et al., 2021). This demonstrates that when the government is open and honest about its policies and processes, the general public is more likely to have confidence in and actively participate in the process of governing. This also promotes increased civic engagement in the process of decision-making, so resulting in policies that are better attuned to the community's needs.

Furthermore, with technical progress, the government can employ many digital channels to augment engagement with residents. Web-based public service portals facilitate citizens' access to government information and services. This not only decreases administrative red tape but also enables the general public to offer direct input to the government. According to research released by the World Bank, the adoption of e-government in different nations has resulted in a notable improvement in the effectiveness of public services and the contentment of citizens (*Improving Transparency and Accountability in Public-Private Partnerships*, 2020). However, in order to attain the most favourable outcomes, it is imperative to establish a legal framework that upholds the utilisation of digital technology in public administration.

Conversely, digital transformation also requires more stringent safeguarding of personal data. As the use of information technology grows, so does the likelihood of data breaches and the improper use of personal information. Hence, it is imperative for the government to formulate legislation that safeguards individual rights in the era of digital technology. This aligns with the data protection principles specified in the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) in Europe, which acts as a benchmark for numerous countries in developing their data protection policies (Cohen, 2014). Therefore, the evolution of administrative law in the digital age involves more than merely utilising technology. It also entails establishing a legal structure that safeguards individual rights and guarantees government transparency.

Modifications in state administrative law also encompass alterations in the configuration of government entities. Due to the emergence of digitalisation,

numerous administrative duties and operations that were previously performed manually have now transitioned to automated systems. Training and skill development for civil workers are necessary to enable them to effectively adapt to emerging technology and comprehend the functioning of digital systems. Research indicates that organisations that effectively undergo digital transformation are those that can foster a culture of innovation and ongoing learning inside their institutions (Shaporenko, 2019).

It is crucial to acknowledge that the changes in administrative law in the digital age also impact elements of supervision and responsibility. Technology enables the government to establish a more efficient surveillance system to ensure the proper execution of policies and programmes. For instance, the use of large-scale data and advanced analytics can expedite the government's ability to identify problems and implement prompt and appropriate measures (Dunleavy & Margetts, 2023). In order to guarantee the efficient functioning of this system, it is imperative to establish unambiguous norms pertaining to data utilisation and the safeguarding of personal privacy.

Moreno et al.'s research reveals that numerous governments worldwide are initiating the adoption of digital platforms to facilitate wider accessibility to public information, hence augmenting openness and accountability (Moreno et al., 2022). The proliferation of digital technology presents novel obstacles for administrative law, requiring the revision of current legislation to harmonise with technological progress and the dynamic demands of society.

Evidence indicates that the utilisation of digital platforms in the field of public administration has the potential to decrease the time required for processing documents by as much as 50% (Moreno et al., 2022). This demonstrates that the collaboration between legal innovation and technology can enhance the administrative efficiency of the state, ultimately leading to an increase in public trust in the government.

The utilisation of administrative law in the digital age involves the adoption of e-government systems in different nations (Ravshanbekov, 2024). In Indonesia, the government has implemented an e-government system that enables citizens to conveniently access public services through the internet. This system encompasses business registration, permit applications, and a range of other administrative services that once necessitated in-person attendance.

Case studies conducted in the Philippines demonstrate that the use of e-

government has led to a notable improvement in public satisfaction with governmental services. The report indicates that 75% of the participants expressed increased satisfaction with government services following the introduction of a digital system that enhances accessibility to information and services (Moreno et al., 2022). This demonstrates that digital transformation not only expedites administrative procedures but also enhances the quality of public services.

Nevertheless, there are still obstacles to overcome in the execution of this plan, such as concerns around data security and privacy. Sarifudin et al.'s research highlights the significance of establishing a robust legislative structure to safeguard people's personal data in the e-government setting in order to uphold public confidence in digital systems (Sarifudin & Damanik, 2024).

Information and Communication Technology (ICT) is essential for improving transparency and accountability in government management. Through the utilisation of digital platforms, the government has the capability to disseminate up-to-date information to the general public, enabling greater participation of society in the process of making decisions. For instance, numerous municipal authorities are currently utilising mobile applications to disseminate information pertaining to budgets and public expenditures.

Shenkoya's research demonstrates that the utilisation of ICT in public administration can augment community involvement in the governance process. The e-government programme implemented by the Nigerian government has effectively augmented community engagement in local budget decision-making by up to 40%. This demonstrates that ICT serves not only as a means to enhance productivity but also as a means to enable communities (Shenkoya, 2022).

Also, technology also facilitates the surveillance and assessment of government performance. Through the utilisation of an online reporting system, members of the public have the ability to directly communicate instances of nonconformity or discontentment over public services, which can then be addressed by the relevant authorities. This establishes a more effective system of responsibility in which the government is obligated to promptly address public grievances.

The case study of e-government deployment in Estonia illustrates the beneficial effects of digital transformation on public administration. Estonia is renowned for being at the forefront of e-government, with nearly all government services accessible through online platforms. Ruden's

research highlights that the e-government system in Estonia has significantly decreased the time needed to access government services by as much as 90% (Rudenko, 2023).

This achievement not only improves effectiveness but also reinforces public confidence in the administration. The data indicates that 90% of Estonians express contentment with the public services they access via digital platforms. This demonstrates that the utilisation of information technology can establish a governmental atmosphere that is both more transparent and more receptive to the demands of the people.

Nevertheless, there are still obstacles to overcome, particularly with regards to ensuring equal access to digital resources and opportunities. Jiménez Gómez and Gascó-Hernández's research highlights the potential marginalisation of several community groups, especially those lacking technological access, during the digitalisation process (Jiménez, 2021). Hence, it is crucial to guarantee that every individual has equitable and unrestricted entry to the digital services furnished by the government.

B. The Effectiveness Of Public Policy Is Impacted By The Transformation Of State Administrative Law.

Measuring and analysing the success of public programmes has become increasingly crucial in the digital era. In this context, effectiveness is determined not only by the attainment of policy objectives but also by the accessibility and comprehensibility of the policy to the general public. The efficacy of public policy is assessed based on its ability to adequately address the requirements of the community, as well as the extent to which transparency and accountability in its execution can bolster public confidence (Disantara & Syaifudin, 2024). ICT facilitates real-time data collection and enables the government to deliver prompt feedback to the people in the digital realm.

Empirical data demonstrates a positive correlation between the implementation of digital technology in public administration and elevated levels of public satisfaction. For instance, polls conducted in Singapore indicate that 85% of inhabitants express contentment with the public services delivered via digital applications. (Sgrò, 2021). This demonstrates that digitalisation not only expedites administrative procedures but also improves the user experience. Nevertheless, there are still obstacles to overcome, particularly in terms of ensuring that technology is accessible to all sectors of society. Hence, it is imperative for the government to

guarantee equitable access to digital services for all citizens.

The favourable impact of digital transformation, which is evident from the drop in operating costs, further improves the efficacy of public policy. Implementation of e-government systems in several nations has demonstrated a significant reduction in administrative expenses of up to 30% (Rudenko, 2023). Nevertheless, it is important to acknowledge the adverse consequences that must be taken into account, such as the possibility of a digital divide that may exacerbate the disparity between individuals with and without access. It is observed that while technology might improve efficiency, disparities in technology access can result in discontentment among underprivileged people (Shenkoya, 2022).

The digitisation of administrative law in the modern period poses substantial obstacles and prospects. An essential obstacle is the requirement for regulatory modifications to adapt technological progress. Several existing laws are inadequate in addressing issues resulting from digitisation, necessitating their reform or updates. For instance, the data protection regulations in numerous nations are currently insufficient to safeguard sensitive information gathered via digital platforms.

However, the potential to improve public involvement and transparency through technology is substantial (Kurniawan, 2022a). The advent of internet platforms has facilitated greater public engagement in the decision-making process. As an illustration, the Estonian government has established an e-Residency system, which enables non-citizens to conveniently utilise online public services, such as registering a corporation and filing taxes (Moreno et al., 2022). This not only improves productivity but also broadens community involvement in the digital economy.

Nevertheless, in order to capitalise on this potential, the government must demonstrate a strong dedication to establishing a conducive atmosphere that fosters innovation and encourages collaboration between the public and private sectors. This can be accomplished by forming strategic relationships that facilitate the sharing of information and resources. Research demonstrates that the cooperation between the government and the business sector in technological advancement can expedite the implementation of impactful and streamlined digital solutions (Jiménez-Gómez & Gascó-Hernández, 2017).

To confront these obstacles and capitalise on possibilities, it is crucial for the government to formulate comprehensive and adaptable policies to bring about transformation. This encompasses providing training to federal workers to comprehend and execute novel technologies, along with

enhancing public understanding regarding their entitlements and obligations within the digital ecosystem.

Transformasi hukum administrasi negara menuju era digital juga membawa sejumlah implikasi sosial dan etis yang perlu diperhatikan. Dalam konteks The transition of administrative law into the digital era also entails several social and ethical ramifications that necessitate careful consideration. Within the legal realm, the incorporation of digital technology has the potential to augment government transparency and responsibility. However, it also introduces fresh obstacles pertaining to safeguarding data privacy, fortifying cybersecurity, and addressing the digital divide. A recent study indicates that incorporating digital technology into public administration can lead to cost savings and enhance the effectiveness of public services. However, there are worries around the potential unauthorised use of personal data by specific entities (Gao, 2018). Hence, it is imperative to develop digital administrative law rules that prioritise both personal data security and inclusiveness, ensuring that individuals in remote locations can also reap the advantages of government digitalisation.

When confronted with this dilemma, authorities must prioritise the development of legislation that addresses both technical progress and the safeguarding of individual rights. For instance, it is imperative to enhance data protection legislation in order to prevent the exploitation of sensitive information while also establishing accountability measures to uphold transparency in the utilisation of public data (Zafarullah & Siddiquee, 2021). Furthermore, it is imperative to improve training and educational initiatives focused on digital literacy to guarantee that all sectors of society, particularly those who are marginalised, possess the capacity to engage in the advancing digital environment (Duarte & Adams, 2020). By following these procedures, the reformation of administrative law can occur in a manner that is both environmentally and socially responsible, resulting in a government that is more receptive and answerable to the general population.

From an ethical perspective, this transition requires the government to be responsible for the transparent and ethical utilisation of technology (Kurniawan, 2022b). It is imperative for the government to guarantee that digital technology is employed to enhance social fairness rather than intensify pre-existing disparities. By implementing appropriate rules, the digitisation of administrative law has the potential to be a highly successful tool in creating a government that is more efficient, equitable, and responsive to the demands of society in the digital era.

C. The Effectiveness of Public Policy: A Comparative Study of the Transformation of Administrative Law

In Italy, the reform of administrative law has experienced substantial changes in conjunction with the growing adoption of digital technologies in public procurement. Sgrò states that the e-procurement system has led to more transparency and accountability in Italy's public procurement process. Evidence indicates that the utilisation of digital platforms has diminished corruption and enhanced public engagement in the procurement process. In 2020, over 80% of the whole public procurement was carried out via digital platforms. This facilitated wider participation from potential bidders and improved the transparency of the process (Sgrò, 2021).

An essential element of this reform is the enhancement of accountability measures. The application of information technology not only improves transparency but also enables more effective monitoring of public expenditures. Studies indicate that the implementation of an e-procurement system enables the government to actively monitor and assess the utilisation of funds in real-time, therefore reducing the likelihood of misappropriation (Sgrò, 2021). This aligns with the concepts of good governance that prioritise the significance of accountability in public management.

Nevertheless, despite notable advancements, obstacles persist. There are ongoing worries over the security of data and the privacy of information in digital networks. Studies indicate that insufficient data protection measures might result in the disclosure of confidential information, which can then be exploited by unscrupulous entities. Hence, it is imperative for the Italian government to persist in enhancing legislation pertaining to data protection and privacy in the realm of public procurement.

Likewise, it is crucial to prioritise initiatives aimed at improving the digital literacy of government personnel in order to effectively deploy the e-procurement system. Lacking sufficient comprehension of technology, employees may face difficulties in effectively utilising the system, hence impeding the objectives of openness and accountability (Sgrò, 2021). Hence, it is imperative to incorporate training and education in the realm of information technology into government employee development initiatives.

In summary, the changes in administrative legislation in Italy regarding

public procurement demonstrate that the utilisation of digital technology can effectively improve openness and accountability. Nevertheless, the current obstacles need to be tackled by implementing stringent laws and improving the ability of the workforce.

In the Philippines, there is a clear demonstration of the evolution of administrative law through initiatives aimed at improving transparency and accountability in public services. Castillo and Gabriel observed that the utilisation of information technology has facilitated more public involvement in the process of making decisions. Online platforms enable citizens to contribute input and comments regarding government policies and programmes, thereby bolstering the public's feeling of ownership and faith in the government (Castillo & Gabriel, 2020).

Statistics indicate that in 2019, over 65% of the population in the Philippines perceived an improvement in their ability to obtain public information due to the utilisation of digital technologies. This demonstrates that digitalisation not only improves transparency but also fortifies democracy by empowering the public to participate in the governance process (Castillo & Gabriel, 2020).

Nevertheless, the obstacle encountered by the Philippines in this process is the inequitable availability of technology. Residents in remote areas face significant challenges in accessing the internet, resulting in limited engagement in the digital governance process. Hence, it is imperative for the government to enhance the technological infrastructure and promote equitable access to digital services across all segments of society.

Furthermore, despite certain advancements in transparency, there remain apprehensions surrounding corruption and the misuse of authority in public administration. Studies indicate that despite the implementation of enhanced reporting and complaint mechanisms, numerous instances of corruption continue to go unreported as a result of inadequate safeguards for individuals who expose wrongdoing. In order to tackle this problem, it is imperative to implement more robust policies that safeguard persons who report instances of abuse (Castillo & Gabriel, 2020).

The transformation of administrative law in the Philippines demonstrates that while technology has the potential to improve openness and accountability, it is crucial to also tackle social and structural obstacles. The Philippines can enhance the correlation between democracy and public services by improving infrastructure and safeguarding individual rights.

IV. Conclusion

- A. The utilisation of information and communication technology (ICT) in the digital era to improve efficiency, transparency, and accountability in governance has led to a shift in administrative law. The use of e-government enables convenient access to public services, streamlines administrative procedures, and expedites bureaucratic processes, as exemplified by the successful implementation in Estonia and the Philippines. The digitalisation of government services in these countries has significantly improved public satisfaction and engagement. Nevertheless, this conversion also encounters obstacles, namely with the safeguarding of personal information. Given the growing threat of data breaches, legislation like the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) has gained significance in safeguarding individual rights. Furthermore, the issue of digital inclusion arises, as marginalised groups lacking access to technology face the risk of being left behind, necessitating the implementation of rules that guarantee equitable access. Furthermore, to effectively adapt to new technologies, it is important to address the issues mentioned earlier, as well as implement changes in organisational structure and strengthen the capabilities of government employees. The government should build a regulatory framework that facilitates the implementation of information and communication technology (ICT). In general, this change has the capacity to improve government efficiency, reinforce responsibility, and establish a more open and receptive atmosphere to the community's needs.
- B. The digitisation of administrative law in the modern period has a substantial influence on the efficacy of public policy, specifically by enhancing accessibility, openness, and accountability. Utilising information technology allows for the immediate gathering of data, expedites government actions, and decreases operational expenses by as much as 30%. Countries such as Singapore and Estonia have seen a rise in public contentment with digital services. However, the digital divide continues to be a substantial obstacle, particularly in relation to marginalised people's access to technology. Regulatory adjustments are necessary to adapt to technological advancements, such as personal data protection and cybersecurity. The government should bolster legislation safeguarding individual rights in the digital age and improve public digital literacy. Furthermore, a partnership between the government and the private sector has the potential to expedite the implementation of cutting-edge and all-encompassing technical advancements. In summary, this transition offers substantial prospects for improving the efficiency of public policy. However, it requires careful consideration of social, ethical, and inclusionary factors

to ensure that government digitalisation is not only efficient but also equitable and accountable to society.

- C. An analysis comparing the transformation of administrative law in Italy and the Philippines reveals that the adoption of digital technologies improves transparency and accountability in public administration. The adoption of the e-procurement system in Italy has effectively mitigated corruption and enhanced public engagement in procurement processes. However, there are still obstacles to overcome, including concerns around data security and the need to improve digital literacy. The government should enhance data protection legislation and offer technical training to employees. In the Philippines, the process of digitalisation has provided the people with more access to information and has enhanced their involvement in decision-making. Nevertheless, the uneven distribution of technology in rural regions and the presence of corruption continue to provide obstacles. In order to promote public governance, it is imperative for the government to enhance technical infrastructure and ensure the protection of whistleblowers. In summary, the utilisation of digital technology in administrative law has significant possibilities for improving the efficiency of public policy. However, in order to obtain the best outcomes, it is necessary to implement rigorous regulations and ensure fair development of the necessary skills and resources.

References

- Bezzina, F., Camilleri, E., & Marmarà, V. (2021). Transparency and Accountability Public Service Reforms. In *Public Administration, Governance and Globalization* (pp. 91–104). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-74357-4_3
- Castillo, L. C., & Gabriel, A. G. (2020). Transparency and Accountability in the Philippine Local Government. In *Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance* (pp. 1–9). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-31816-5_3895-1
- Cohen, S. (2014). Transparency and Public Policy: Where Open Government Fails Accountability. In *Transparency in Politics and the Media*. I.B.Tauris. <https://doi.org/10.5040/9780755694716.ch-006>
- Demšar, F. (2024). Transparency Challenges for Business and Privacy. In *Library of Public Policy and Public Administration* (pp. 75–87). Springer Nature Switzerland. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-55645-6_5
- Dharmawan, N. K. S., Kasih, D. P. D., Samsithawrati, P. A., & Dwijayanthi, P. T. (2023). Digital Management of Traditional Cultural Expressions: Why It is Needed in the Context of Gaining the Benefit-Sharing. *Proceedings of the International Conference on "Changing of Law: Business Law, Local Wisdom and Tourism Industry"* (ICCLB 2023), 1156–1166. https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-38476-180-7_117

- Dharmawan, N. K. S., Kasih, D. P. D., Samsithawrati, P. A., Dwijayanthi, P. T., Salain, M. S. P. D., Mahaswari, M., Ustriyana, M. G., & Moisa, R. V. (2024). Quo Vadis Traditional Cultural Expressions Protection: Threats from Personal Intellectual Property and Artificial Intelligence. *LAW REFORM*, 19(2), 321–343. <https://doi.org/10.14710/lr.v19i2.58639>
- Dharmawan, N. K. S., Sarjana, I. M., Kurniawan, I. G. A., & Samsithawrati, P. A. (2023). The Existence of Collective Management Organization for Copyrights Protection: Do Its Roles Applicable for Dance Copyright Work? In *Proceedings of the 3rd International Conference on Business Law and Local Wisdom in Tourism (ICBLT 2022)* (pp. 861–871). Atlantis Press SARL. https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-494069-93-0_100
- Disantara, F. P., Permatasari A. B, R. M., Ilmiah, F., & Chansrakaeo, R. (2023). The Integralistic State Idea: Reconstruction of Administrative Efforts Perspective. *Jurnal Daulat Hukum*, 6(2), 130. <https://doi.org/10.30659/jdh.v6i2.30982>
- Disantara, F. P., & Syaifudin, A. (2024). VIRALITY OF LAW ENFORCEMENT IN INDONESIA: A REVIEW OF SOCIAL AND LEGAL CHANGES. *Syiah Kuala Law Journal*, 8(2), 1–12. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24815/sklj.v8i1.40001>
- Duarte, N., & Adams, S. (2020). Policy 101. In *Proceedings of the 2020 Conference on Fairness, Accountability, and Transparency* (p. 703). ACM. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3351095.3375668>
- Dunleavy, P., & Margetts, H. (2023). Data science, artificial intelligence and the third wave of digital era governance. In *Public Policy and Administration*. SAGE Publications. <https://doi.org/10.1177/09520767231198737>
- Efendi, A., & Disantara, F. P. (2022). Post Conditionally Unconstitutional of Job Creation Law: Quo Vadis Legal Certainty? *Yuridika*, 37(2), 329–366. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.20473/ydk.v37i2.33364>
- Gao, J. (2018). Book Review: State Governance by Targets: Bureaucratic Accountability, Performance Gaps, and Government Behaviors. In *Chinese Public Administration Review* (Vol. 9, Issue 2, pp. 148–149). SAGE Publications. <https://doi.org/10.22140/cpar.v9i2.184>
- Improving Transparency and Accountability in Public-Private Partnerships*. (2020). World Bank. <https://doi.org/10.1596/36598>
- Jiménez-Gómez, C. E., & Gascó-Hernández, M. (2017). Achieving Open Justice through Citizen Participation and Transparency. In *Advances in Public Policy and Administration*. IGI Global. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-5225-0717-8>
- Jiménez, G. (2021). Non-judicial legal accountability. In *Accountability and the Law* (pp. 102–125). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003168331-9>
- Kurniawan, I. G. A. (2022a). The Enforcement of Progressive Law: Optimizing Alternative Dispute Resolution as the Implementation of Pancasila Values. *International Conference Towards Humanity Justice for Law Enforcement and Dispute Settlement*, 1(1), 1–11.
- Kurniawan, I. G. A. (2022b). The Reconstruction of Subjectum Litis in Term of Reflections on Constitutional Dissolution of Political Parties. *Jurnal Akta*, 9(1), 104–119. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.30659/akta.v9i1.20970>
- Kurniawan, I. G. A. (2022c). Digitalization of Business Law: Urgency and Orientation of the Industrial Revolution 4.0 and Society 5.0. *Volksgeist: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Dan Konstitusi*, 5(2), 253–265. <https://doi.org/10.24090/volksgeist.v5i2.6847>
- Moreno, C., Verma, V. K., & Simon, J.-Y. (2022). Digital Transparency and Open Data. In *Global*

- Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance* (pp. 3295–3308). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-66252-3_3957
- Ningrat, A. A. S. I. R. A. P., & Kurniawan, I. G. A. (2023). Digital Business Problems and Regulations in an Integrative Legal Perspective. *Syiah Kuala Law Journal*, 7(2), 141–156.
- Ravshanbekov, B. (2024). Transition from Traditional Public Administration to Digital Public Administration and Adaptation of Public Administration to Emerging Technologies. In *International Journal of Law and Policy* (Vol. 2, Issue 5, pp. 7–15). Irshad Journals. <https://doi.org/10.59022/ijlp.183>
- Rudenko, O. M. (2023). ELECTRONIC VOTING AS THE HIGHEST LEVEL OF APPLICATION OF DIGITAL TECHNOLOGIES IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND LEGAL MECHANISM OF STATE POLICY. In *Law and public administration* (Issue 1, pp. 309–314). Publishing House Helvetica (Publications). <https://doi.org/10.32782/pdu.2023.1.46>
- Sarifudin, R., & Damanik, F. H. S. (2024). Enhancing transparency and accountability in public administration through information technology utilization. In *Gema Wiralodra* (Vol. 15, Issue 1, pp. 32–40). Universitas Wiralodra. <https://doi.org/10.31943/gw.v15i1.661>
- Sgrò, F. (2021). Transparency and accountability of the Italian public administration in the context of public procurement. In *Accountability and the Law* (pp. 174–192). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003168331-13>
- Shaporenko, O. (2019). State migration policy: ways of regulation and principles. In *Law and public administration* (Vol. 2, Issue 2, pp. 252–257). Publishing House Helvetica (Publications). <https://doi.org/10.32840/pdu.2-2.36>
- Shenkoya, T. (2022). Can digital transformation improve transparency and accountability of public governance in Nigeria? In *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy* (Vol. 17, Issue 1, pp. 54–71). Emerald. <https://doi.org/10.1108/tg-08-2022-0115>
- Zafarullah, H., & Siddiquee, N. A. (2021). Open government and the right to information: Implications for transparency and accountability in Asia. In *Public Administration and Development* (Vol. 41, Issue 4, pp. 157–168). Wiley. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pad.1944>